

Report of the Principal Auditor on the Accounts of the Gibraltar Port Authority for the financial year ended 31 March 2016

# REPORT OF THE PRINCIPAL AUDITOR ON THE ACCOUNTS OF THE GIBRALTAR PORT AUTHORITY FOR THE FINANCIAL YEAR ENDED 31 MARCH 2016

#### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

|                        | Page |
|------------------------|------|
| Audit Certificate      | 1    |
| Report on the Accounts | 3    |
| Accounts               | 6    |



## THE CERTIFICATE OF THE PRINCIPAL AUDITOR TO PARLIAMENT ON THE ACCOUNTS OF THE GIBRALTAR PORT AUTHORITY

I certify that I have audited the financial statements of the Gibraltar Port Authority for the financial year ended 31 March 2016 in accordance with the provisions of Section 14(2) of the Gibraltar Port Authority Act 2005. These statements comprise the Receipts and Payments Account, the Capital Account, the Balance Sheet and the related notes. These financial statements have been prepared using the cash receipts and disbursements basis of accounting.

# Respective responsibilities of the Gibraltar Port Authority and the Principal Auditor

The Gibraltar Port Authority is responsible for the preparation of the financial statements and for being satisfied that they are properly presented. The Gibraltar Port Authority's policy is to prepare the financial statements on the cash receipts and disbursements basis. On this basis revenue is recognised when received rather than when earned, and expenses are recognised when paid rather than when incurred.

My responsibility is to audit, certify and report on the financial statements in accordance with the provisions of section 14(2) and 14(3) of the Gibraltar Port Authority Act 2005. I conducted my audit of the financial statements in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards.

#### Scope of the audit of the financial statements

An audit involves obtaining evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the financial statements sufficient to give reasonable assurance that the financial statements are free from material misstatement, whether caused by fraud or error. This includes an assessment of: whether the accounting policies are appropriate to the Gibraltar Port Authority's circumstances and have been consistently applied and adequately disclosed; and the overall presentation of the financial statements. If I become aware of any apparent material misstatements or inconsistencies, I consider the implications for my certificate.

I am required to obtain evidence sufficient to give reasonable assurance that the income and expenditure recorded in the financial statements have been applied to the purposes intended by Parliament and the financial transactions recorded in the financial statements conform to the authorities which govern them.

#### Opinion on regularity

In my opinion, in all material respects, the income and expenditure recorded in the financial statements have been applied to the purposes intended by Parliament and the financial transactions recorded in the financial statements conform to the authorities which govern them.

#### **Opinion on financial statements**

In my opinion, the financial statements properly present the revenue collected and expenses paid by the Gibraltar Port Authority during the financial year ended 31 March 2016 and the assets and liabilities arising from cash transactions as at the end of that period in accordance with the cash receipts and disbursements basis of accounting.

#### Matters for which I report by exception

I have nothing to report in respect of the following matters, which I report to you if, in my opinion:

- I have not received all of the information and explanations, which to the best of my knowledge and belief were necessary for the purposes of my audit; or
- proper books of account have not been kept by the Gibraltar Port Authority, so far as appears from my examination of those books; or
- the financial statements are not in agreement with the accounting records.

Nevertheless, I have to report that during the financial year 2015-16, the Gibraltar Port Authority did not fully discharge its financial duties and obligations in accordance with the provisions of the Gibraltar Port Authority Act 2005. Tonnage Dues charged during the financial year was not in accordance with Schedule 4 of the Port Rules, instead a flat daily fee of £100 was charged by the then Chief Executive and Captain of the Port. As a consequence, a total of £ 129,234 was undercharged in Government revenue during the financial year. Further details are included in my report on the accounts of the Gibraltar Port Authority for the financial year ended 31 March 2016 on page 3.

#### Report

The observations on the financial statements are detailed in my Report.

A R Sacramento Principal Auditor Gibraltar Audit Office

21 January 2021

## GIBRALTAR PORT AUTHORITY ACCOUNTS FOR THE FINANCIAL YEAR ENDED 31 MARCH 2016

#### REPORT

#### Matters for which I Report by Exception

- 1.1 Tonnage Dues An examination of the revenue received in respect of Tonnage Dues revealed that the Gibraltar Port Authority ("GPA") did not charge Tonnage Dues in compliance with Schedule 4 of the Port Rules during the period August 2015 to January 2018. The then Captain of the Port and Chief Executive granted, on request by Port clients, a flat rate daily fee of £100 to vessels anchoring at the Eastern Anchorage without there being any legal provision under the Port Rules to award such a discounted fee. As a consequence, a total of £129,234 was undercharged in Government revenue during the financial year ended 31 March 2016.
- 1.2 Although the decision taken by the Captain of the Port to reduce Tonnage Dues in the Eastern Anchorage was to incentivise anchorage activity, which in turn, it was thought, would generate greater economic activity in other sectors within Gibraltar –and undoubtedly the move by the Captain was done in the best economic interests of Gibraltar– the fact is that the Captain acted outside the provisions of the law, as the Port Rules do not provide for the reduced fee rate awarded, nor has the legislation been amended to reflect this.
- 1.3 As a consequence of the discounted rate awarded, a total of £917,697 was undercharged in Government revenue during the period that the pilot scheme was ran from August 2015 to January 2018. The total sum undercharged in Tonnage Dues, broken down by financial years, is as follows:

| Financial Year | Tonnage Due<br>Undercharge |  |
|----------------|----------------------------|--|
| 2015-16        | £129,234                   |  |
| 2016-17        | £404,024                   |  |
| 2017-18        | £384,439                   |  |
| Total          | £917,697                   |  |

1.4 I am gravely concerned at the loss of Government revenue resulting from the action taken by the then Captain of the Port, particularly because the pilot scheme, although well-intentioned, was ran over a protracted period of 30 months without there being any performance indicators or feedback from the shipping agents to show that the initiative had generated additional economic activity in other sectors. This was confirmed by a Port Circular issued by the Captain of the Port to shipping agents on 3 April 2017, where he informs them that no information had been forthcoming from the shipping agents who had benefitted from the initiative. The discounted flat rate scheme ceased immediately after the Captain of the Port and Chief Executive's

successor was appointed Captain of the Port in January 2018, as he had always advised against this initiative in his capacity as Deputy Captain of the Port.

#### Variance Report

- **Recurrent Account Receipts:** Total port receipts for the financial year 2015-16, amounting to £4,418,046, fell short against the approved budget of £5,056,000 by £637,954 and by £394,817 compared against the previous year's total collections amounting to £4,812,863.
- 2.2 The Finance Manager of the GPA explained that the 2015-16 budget submission for port receipts was calculated on the basis of the actual revenue figures for 2014-15. However, the estimates did not take into account the impact the decision to reduce the Tonnage Due tariff to £100 per day for vessels visiting the Eastern Anchorage would have on revenue. As previously mentioned, the reduced tariff, which was introduced in the second quarter of the financial year, resulted in a loss of Tonnage Dues revenue of £0.13m over the year. Although when compared to the same period in the previous financial year there had been an increase of 17% in the number of vessels who had visited the Eastern Anchorage from August 2015 to March 2016, the increase was not high enough to absorb the reduction in tariff. Another contributing factor for the decrease in revenue was attributed to the overall reduction in the number of vessels visiting the port and the significant drop in long-term arrested vessels. Conversely, there was an increase of 15.7% in cruise visits which generated an increase in Port Arrival and Departure Tax revenue of £0.22m when compared to the previous financial year. However, a rebate payment to a shipping agent amounting to £0.11m, that was due to be paid at the end of the financial year, was paid at the beginning of the following year. In addition, there was an increase in Port Operator and Harbour Craft Licences receipts between the approved budget and actual revenue amounting to £0.05m. This was mainly as a result of revenue generated from the increase of Small Boat Licences brought about by the augmentation of vessels following the development of the New Harbours Small Boats Marina and the revenue generated in respect of expired licences.
- 2.3 The Government of Gibraltar's recurrent contribution from revenues received to the GPA during the financial year 2015-16 amounted to £4,418,046. The Government made an additional contribution amounting to £864,000 to provide for total expenditure of £5,282,008 incurred during the financial year. The GPA's operating shortfall was thus £863,962.
- **Recurrent Account Payments:** The GPA's recurrent expenditure during the financial year 2015-16, amounting to £5,282,008 reflected a decrease of £3,008, compared to the approved budget of £5,279,000 and a year-on-year decrease of £214,686, against the previous financial year's expenditure of £5,496,694. The Finance Manager provided me with the following explanations on the main variances between the recurrent expenditure and the approved budget for the financial year:

- **3.2 Salaries** There was a saving in Salaries amounting to £54,776, compared against the approved budget sum of £2,078,000, largely as a result of a number of unfilled vacant posts, retirements, one resignation and an abolished post.
- **Overtime** Conversely, the aforementioned unfilled vacant posts had an adverse knock-on effect on the overtime expenditure, as these posts were covered by employees doing overtime. As a result, there was an excess of £79,573 in overtime expenditure against the approved budget of £668,000.
- **3.4 Oil Pollution Expenses** There was a saving of £18,645 in Oil Pollution Expenses compared to the approved estimate of £70,000. This was largely the consequence of having increased the budget by £20,000 in anticipation of there being an increase in pollution containment and clean-up costs during the year.
- **3.5** Advertising, Marketing and Travel Total expenditure amounting to £165,687 exceeded the approved estimate of £100,000 by £65,687, as a result of costs relating to an advertising and public relations campaign that had not been budgeted for as the GPA had not known of the advertising campaign when the estimates were prepared.
- 4.1 <u>Capital Account Payments</u>: Capital expenditure during the financial year 2015-16 totalled £151,196, compared to an approved estimate of £163,000. The reason provided for the shortfall of £11,804 was that the original projects that were planned for in the budget submission for the year, did not go ahead.

A R Sacramento
Principal Auditor
Gibraltar Audit Office

21 January 2022

#### RECEIPTS AND PAYMENTS ACCOUNT FOR THE YEAR ENDED 31 MARCH 2016

| RECURRENT ACCOUNT  | Notes | £         | £          | £                    | <u>2015</u><br>£  |
|--|-------|-----------|------------|----------------------|-------------------|
| RECEIPTS   |       |           |            | •                    |                   |
| Contribution by the Government of Gibraltar  |       |           |            |                      |                   |
| from Revenues Received   | 2     |           |            | 1 110 010            | 1010.00           |
| Contribution by the Government of Gibraltar  | 2     |           |            | 4 418,046            | 4,812,863         |
| The second secon |       |           | -          | 864,000<br>5 282,046 | <u>684,000</u>    |
|  |       |           |            | 5.202,046            | 5,496,863         |
| <u>PAYMENTS</u>  |       |           |            |                      |                   |
| Personal Emoluments:   |       |           |            |                      |                   |
| Salaries   |       | 2,023,224 |            |                      | 2,058,655         |
| Gratuities   |       | 12,975    |            |                      | 12,653            |
| Overtime   |       | 747,573   |            |                      | 754,888           |
| Allowances   |       | 203,915   |            |                      | 198,478           |
| Temporary Assistance   |       |           | 0.00= 0.0- |                      | 27,702            |
| Employer's Contributions:  |       |           | 2,987,687  |                      | 3,052,376         |
| Social Insurance   |       | 91,887    |            |                      | 00.000            |
| Pension  |       | 106,871   |            |                      | 92,690            |
|  |       | 100,071   | 198,758    |                      | 86,250<br>178,940 |
|  |       |           | 100,700    |                      | 170,940           |
| Office Expenses:   |       |           |            |                      |                   |
| General Expenses   |       | 7,018     |            |                      | 7,173             |
| Electricity and Water  |       | 33,884    |            |                      | 25,833            |
| Telephone Service  |       | 37,914    | ,          |                      | 34,054            |
| Printing and Stationery  |       | .12,918   |            |                      | 14,663            |
| Legal Fees   |       | 23,601    | 445.005    |                      |                   |
| Operational Services:  |       |           | 115,335    |                      | 81,723            |
| Transport Expenses   |       | 8,693     |            |                      | 2.007             |
| Maintenance of Port Installations and Equipment  | 3     | 315,019   |            |                      | 2,997<br>344,786  |
| Protective Clothing and Uniforms   | •     | 16,395    |            |                      | 20,509            |
| Training   |       | 83,374    |            |                      | 20,509<br>83,690  |
| Inspections  |       | 11,584    |            |                      | 4,364             |
| Oil Pollution Expenses   |       | 51,355    |            |                      | 60,672            |
| Publications   |       | 6,138     |            |                      | 5,042             |
|  |       |           | 492,558    |                      | 522,060           |
| Contracted Services:   |       |           |            |                      |                   |
| Oil Pollution  |       | 114,586   |            |                      | 107,100           |
| Port Security  |       | 345,930   |            |                      | 324,384           |
| Cleaning Services  |       | 18,843    |            |                      | 14,614            |
| Waste Discharge Weather Transmission Reports   |       | 545,106   |            | ı                    | 501,349           |
| vvcaurer transmission reports  | •     | 9,125     | 4 000 500  |                      | 9,125             |
|  |       |           | 1,033,590  |                      | 956,572           |
| Carried Forward  |       | N/marks   | 4,827,928  |                      | 4,791,671         |

#### RECEIPTS AND PAYMENTS ACCOUNT FOR THE YEAR ENDED 31 MARCH 2016

|   | Notes                | £  | £                 | £                 | <u>2015</u><br>£  |
|---|----------------------|--|-------------------|-------------------|---|
| Brought Forwa   | ard                  |  | 4,827,928         |                   | 4,791,671   |
| PAYMENTS (cont.) Advertising, Marketing and Travel Contribution to Med Mission to Seamen Vessel Tracking System Finance Repayment Vessel Tracking System - Maintenance Low sulphur - Fuel Oil Analysis Insurance Port Incidents and Associated Expenses Contribution to Seaman's Welfare Fund Maintenance of Beach Marker Buoys Relief Cover Contract Relocation Expenses | <b>4</b><br><b>5</b> | 165,687<br>10,000<br>772<br>48,466<br>22,902<br>108,055<br>4,685<br>10,000<br>69,185<br>14,328 |                   |                   | 294,184<br>10,000<br>124,531<br>42,128<br>2,487<br>127,916<br>15,145<br>10,000<br>58,861<br>4,404<br>15,367 |
| Net Receipts  |                      | _  | 454,080<br>-<br>= | (5,282,008)<br>38 | 705,023<br>(5,496,694)<br>169   |
| CAPITAL ACCOUNT   |                      |  |                   |                   |   |
| RECEIPTS Contribution by the Government of Gibraltar  |                      |  |                   | 152,000           | 153,000   |
| PAYMENTS Works and Equipment  | 6                    |  |                   | (151,196)         | (153,627)   |
| Net Receipts/(Payments)   |                      |  | -                 | 804               | (627)   |

#### Notes to the Accounts for the Year Ended 31 March 2016

- 1) Accounting Policies:
  - The financial statements of the Gibraltar Port Authority are prepared on a cash receipts and disbursements basis of accounting, in line with the standards prescribed for the preparation of the public accounts of Gibraltar.
- 2) In accordance with the provisions of the Public Finance (Control and Audit) (Amendment) Act 2011 the recurrent revenues of the Gibraltar Port Authority are paid into, and thus constitute the revenue of, the Gibraltar Government Consolidated Fund.

|            |   | £  | <u>2015</u><br>£  |
|------------|---|--|---|
|            | Receipts for the year:  |  |   |
|            | Tonnage Dues  | 2,516,536  | 3,005,882   |
|            | Bunkering Charges   | 566,896  | 658,728   |
|            | Berthing Charges  | 491,308  | 582,679   |
|            | Port Arrival and Departure Tax  | 350,808  | 132,242   |
|            | Port Operator and Harbour Craft Licences  | 255,919  | 208,139   |
|            | Miscellaneous Receipts  | 229,748  | 217,853   |
|            | Small Boat Moorings   | 6,831  | 7,340   |
|            |   | 4,418,046  | 4,812,863   |
| 3)         | Maintenance of Port Installations and Equipment: Upkeep and Maintenance of Port Installations Maintenance of Launches Internet Services Computer Maintenance Port Launches' Fuel Maintenance of Equipment | 51,635<br>67,545<br>44,902<br>32,455<br>13,091<br>5,391<br>315,019 | 113,431<br>110,253<br>36,000<br>14,244<br>41,658<br>29,200<br>344,786 |
| <i>4</i> ) | Advantiaines Blankatines C. Turret  |  |   |
| 4)         | Advertising, Marketing & Travel: Advertising  |  |   |
|            | Travel Expenses   | 71,082   | 91,499  |
|            | Contingencies   | 46,557   | 50,955  |
|            | Website Expenditure   | 21,608   | 4,666   |
|            | Conference Fees   | 16,240<br>5,463  | 97,643  |
|            | Membership Fees   | •  | 47,100  |
|            | General Expenses  | 4,737  | 2,150<br>171  |
|            | and an ampaire a  | 165,687  | 294,184   |
|            |   | 100,007  | 237,104   |

5) A loan of £630,000 was obtained in the financial year 2009-2010 from Lombard North Centra Plc in order to finance a vessel tracking system, to be paid in 60 monthly installments of £11,321 (this figure comprised of capital repayment and 3% interest). The loan repayment was agreed on a variable rate basis with interest being calculated at the end of the month. A residual amount of £772 was outstanding at the end of the term as the repayment plan was based on fixed payment amounts.

## Notes to the accounts for the Year Ended 31 March 2016 (Cont'd)

|                                      |         | <u>2015</u> |
|--------------------------------------|---------|-------------|
|                                      | £       | £           |
| 6) Capital Expenditure for the year: |         |             |
| Motor Vessels Engine Overhauls       | 59,971  | -           |
| Security Infrastructure              | 25,605  | _           |
| Buoys and Equipment                  | 25,310  | 20,852      |
| Upgrade of telephone System          | 14,388  | -           |
| Detached Mole Equipment              | 5,640   | 6,107       |
| I.T. Infrastructure                  | 7,475   | 43,194      |
| Safety Equipment                     | 4,939   | -           |
| Purchase of Computers                | 4,405   | 1,115       |
| Motor Vehicle                        | 2,195   | -           |
| Office Furniture                     | 755     | 4,291       |
| Building Works                       | 513     | 39,319      |
| Purchase of Crane                    | -       | 35,511      |
| Statue for North Mole                | _       | 2,410       |
| Messroom Equipment                   | _       | 828         |
| • •                                  | 151,196 | 153,627     |
|                                      | 101,100 | 100,027     |